Appendix C

Alternative Ranking
### Qualitative Criteria Comparison Explanation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Scoring Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive:</td>
<td>+2 $0.2 million 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral:</td>
<td>+1 $2.4 million 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative:</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Scoring Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive:</td>
<td>+2 $4.8 million 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral:</td>
<td>+1 $8+ million -2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative:</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Social Considerations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative</th>
<th>Existing Home Elimination</th>
<th>Existing Home Encroachment</th>
<th>Impact on Neighborhood</th>
<th>Community Acceptance</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
<th>Impact to Emergency Services</th>
<th>Traffic Circulation</th>
<th>Adherence to Road Standards</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
<th>Social and Transportation Combined Score</th>
<th>Cost Considerations</th>
<th>Overall Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALT 0: No action (eventual closure)</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$0.0M</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 1: Reconstruct and Widen Existing Banner Road</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>$0.4M</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 2: Banner Rd SE Realignment</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>$0.9M</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 3: One Way Banner Rd SE and One Way Price Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>$5.1M</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 4: SE Banfill Rd Realignment and Close Banner Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>$10.5M</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 5: Close Banner Rd SE and Close Price Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>$0.3M</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 6: Extend SE Culver Sl and Close Banner Rd SE, Close Price Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>$3.5M</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 6C: Extend SE Culver Sl north and west to Olalla Valley Rd and Close Banner Rd SE SE, Close Price Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>$3.9M</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 7: Realign SE Culver Sl and Close Banner Rd SE, Close Price Rd SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$3.5M</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 10: Close Banner Rd SE and construct New Roadway from the 90 degree bend in Banner Rd SE to Olalla Valley Road SE</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>$0.4M</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 11: Close Banner Rd SE and construct New Roadway from Banner Road SE to Orchard Ave SE</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>$5.7M</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 12: Close Banner Rd SE and construct New Roadway from Banner Road SE to Orchard Ave SE</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>$0.3M</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Environmental Considerations

Environmental considerations were not included in the initial matrix at the preliminary level as there is not enough data to make quantifiable differentiations between alternatives. Environmental considerations will be included for the top alternatives that are studied further.
## Banner Road
### Alternatives Analysis Comparison of Top Three Alternatives

#### Screening Criteria Matrix
Revised: 9/29/2011

**Qualitative Criteria Comparison Explanation**
- **Positive**: Results in an overall benefit to the community
- **Neutral**: No significant or measurable change
- **Negative**: Adverse impact

#### Cost Considerations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative</th>
<th>Existing Home Elimination</th>
<th>Existing Home Encroachment</th>
<th>Impact on Neighborhood</th>
<th>Community Acceptance</th>
<th>Impact to Emergency Services</th>
<th>Traffic Circulation</th>
<th>Adherence to Road Standards</th>
<th>Environmental Considerations</th>
<th>Cost Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALT 1 - Reconstruct and Widen Existing Banner Road</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Minor wetlands, or if low protected shoreline impacts</td>
<td>$4.2M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 6C - Extend SE Culver St north and west to Olalla Valley Rd and Close Banner Rd SE, Close Price Rd SE</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Three</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Somewhat negative</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Streams, Wetlands</td>
<td>$4.3M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALT 10 - Close Banner Rd SE and construct New Roadway B from Banner Rd SE to Olalla Valley Road SE</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Very negative</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Streams, Wetlands</td>
<td>$6.3M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>